



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

10:04 AM

2. **ROLL CALL**

Members Present:

Voting Member Aurore Bleck
Voting Member Kendra Garcia
Voting Member Kathlyne Gish
Voting Member Pam Parfitt
Voting Member Angelique Montoya-Chavez
Voting Member Meriam Jawhar
Voting Member Jose "Eli" Fresquez

Members Excused:

Voting Member Hope Reed
Voting Member Victor Hughes

Others Attending:

Tom Graham, Attendee
Alan Webber, Attendee

3. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Chair Gish requested to move Member Fresquez's discussion item 8 (B) up on the agenda to item 7 (B) and all subsequent items to be listed appropriately.

MOTION: Voting Member Bleck moved, seconded by Voting Member Garcia, to approve the agenda as amended.

VOTE: The motion was approved on the following Roll Call vote:

For: Voting Member Bleck, Voting Member Garcia, Voting Member Gish, Voting Member Parfitt, Voting Member Montoya-Chavez, Voting Member Jawhar, Voting Member Fresquez

Against: None



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Abstain: None

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a. February 17, 2022 Meeting Minutes

Member Bleck pointed out two typographical errors that have been fixed.

MOTION: Voting Member Parfitt moved, seconded by Voting Member Jawhar, to approve the 2/17/2022 Minutes as amended.

VOTE: The motion was approved on the following Roll Call vote:

For: Voting Member Bleck, Voting Member Garcia, Voting Member Gish, Voting Member Parfitt, Voting Member Montoya-Chavez, Voting Member Jawhar, Voting Member Fresquez

Against: None

Abstain: None

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS (15 MINUTES TOTAL)

- a. Public Comments from Website

There are no members of the public present in the Attendee Room and no public comments were posted to the website.

6. PRESENTATIONS

- a. None

7. ACTION ITEMS: DISCUSSION

- a. Proposing a Brain Injury Subcommittee (Meriam Jawhar)



City of Santa Fe

MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Member Jawhar presented the community need in Santa Fe for a Brain Injury Subcommittee to address the struggles of brain injury that are prevalent in all demographics within the City. She has developed coping skills that she would like to pass on and help others experiencing similar struggles to be able to function and live to their highest potential as she has learned to do. Everybody and every brain injury is different and people may be experiencing difficult things that this committee could be helpful with. She's still formulating the picture and idea of how the subcommittee would be functional to help identify and support these individuals and how this can work with the Mayor's Committee on Disability to assist specifically for people with brain injuries. She then proposed to the MCD for the establishment of this Subcommittee with her as the Chair of the subcommittee.

Member Bleck said that she supported the idea to add it to the list of subcommittees and identify brain injury as another category and service that people can reach out and have a place to go, or know where to go for assistance.

Member Fresquez also supported the idea and mentioned the NM State BIAC (Brain Injury Advisor Council) and the resources they have available. He suggested developing a list of resources specific to local brain injury dedicated to this part of the state.

Member Jawhar appreciated Member Fresquez's comment and identified that she was a Governor appointed member of BIAC for eight years and is familiar with their successes and resources. She knows there are many different resources located in many different locations and that for her to develop a consolidated list of resources fine tuned specific to Santa Fe would be a very useful.

Vice Chair Garcia also supported the formation of a local list, but because some of the State's major resources are in some of the larger cities within New Mexico, she suggested including them on the list of resources, so as to not deny anyone of the possible assistance that may be available to them. She also mentioned that perhaps the MCD could support some type of campaign to help get the word out that this information is available.

Chair Gish also expressed her support for the formation of a Brain Injury Subcommittee.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

MOTION: Voting Member Bleck moved, seconded by Voting Member Garcia, to approve and support the formation of a Brain Injury Subcommittee with Member Jawhar acting as Chair as presented.

VOTE: The motion was approved on the following Roll Call vote:

For: Voting Member Bleck, Voting Member Garcia, Voting Member Gish, Voting Member Parfitt, Voting Member Montoya-Chavez, Voting Member Jawhar, Voting Member Fresquez

Against: None

Abstain: None

b. Updates regarding Letter of Accommodation for a Stenographer (Eli Fresquez)

Member Fresquez drafted a letter based on the previous communication letter for the AFN Kits requesting what is needed for these meetings and more importantly, for members of the public. His draft letter is requesting CART captioning which is transcription live captioning by a human and this can be done with Zoom or other internet platforms, but can also be done live on a screen, in person depending how we set it up. What we use now for the Zoom meetings is transcription captioning through speech recognition which is sometimes, somewhat accurate, but often not. For clarity, Member Fresquez has suggested using a transcription service with CART captioning and this does cost money, but is required under the ADA if it's requested.

Mr. Graham provided possible considerations to think about while finalizing the letter, about how the City currently has undertaken the expense of the voice recognition closed captioning software and a loop system in the City Council Chambers (that may or may not need to be repaired or updated to current standards for functionality) and that this is to be provided on an as requested basis by people with these disabilities. The current pulse of the City personnel providing these services is that they are providing the required services, but it is the MCD's place to educate them how this is not the case and instead of demanding something, possible rephrasing it to educate them and allow them to make the right decision to make it better for everyone.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Member Parfitt stated that she finds voice recognition captioning, useless. Because she is a lip reader, she's trying to get all the facial cues that she can to understand and when she has to read something that is several sentences behind and inaccurate, it doesn't match with what she's seeing and is not helpful. She knows that CART transcription services are way superior and she doesn't know what the cost is, but the instantaneous response is great. Member Parfitt is also a member of the HLAA and their efforts are focused on providing functional loop systems in all public venues with PA systems that can be used with people's hearing aids, so she would like to see CART transcription for online meetings, but would like to continue to push for the loop systems for in-person meetings. The current state of development for the voice recognition software that we are using is useless for her.

Member Fresquez said that in reference to the cost of the services, if the City already has a person in their employment that is trained to provide these services, then the cost would be nil and the MCD would just need to request to have them present at these Zoom meetings to provide the services. Member Fresquez said that the cost for CART services is primarily for the person doing the transcription and if the City already has somebody trained for this, that would offset the cost, but he said if not, the cost is about \$100 an hour, give or take.

Member Parfitt was confused about the difference between a CART Stenographer and the Stenographer the MCD had prior to the pandemic, because that stenographer's notes were not word for word and a complete transcription of the meeting.

Member Fresquez stated that the terminology is a little interchangeable, but a stenographer who is trained in word for word transcription, would be able to provide CART services. So if the City has a trained stenographer, we could utilize them in Zoom meetings for CART transcription services.

Mr. Graham said he wasn't sure if the City has somebody trained for those services, or if they would be contracted.

Chair Gish said that she didn't know either, but she does know that Liz (Martin) the previous stenographer was the most accurate and comprehensive stenographer the MCD ever had and she was also very helpful in understanding the Open Meetings Act and processes necessary for the MCD to conduct business.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Member Bleck and Chair Gish agreed that the language can emphasize that it is more accessible to more people, more clear to a population that needs more clarity and access.

Member Fresquez made one last point, that there is something under the ADA called “primary consideration” and that is when a particular request is made for a type of service. Under the ADA, the State and Local government is required to give the requested service “primary consideration” above any other alternatives unless the State and Local government can show that their proposed alternative is equally effective in accommodating and as accessible as the primary consideration. So this is contemplated under the ADA and there is a process in order to determine what is suitable based on the person and the group that is requesting the primary consideration for effective communication.

Member Parfitt added that for the hearing impaired and deaf/blind people, CART services and a hearing loop together is covering all the bases. When she sees something written in real time, it clarifies what she’s missed even with a loop or lip read. She does not want to diminish the importance of hearing loops or CART services and if there is way to provide both of them a lot of people could understand.

Chair Gish emphasized that the point of this committee is to reach as many people as possible and not everyone has access to various equipment and has the money for hearing aids even. So the MCD really needs to be as accessible as it can be to reach as many people and provide as many forms of accessibility needs as possible, especially for the MCD who needs to reach their constituents and be able to communicate to the population that we are representing within the city. She is concerned that without essential forms of communication both to the population and to receive communication from them, something really important could be missed.

Member Bleck said that the letter could say that the CART services would replace the voice recognition software used with virtual meetings, but not replace the need for a functional hearing loop. So that it is understood that they are represented as needing both together.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Vice Chair Garcia brought up the comments in the chat, and Chair Gish read the comments: Member Fresquez wrote that CART also supports people with cognitive disabilities and English as a second language. Member Montoya-Chavez wrote I think it's important for everyone to be provided with the least restrictive environment.

- c. Continuation reviewing 2019-2020 MCD Priorities and finalizing updates of priorities for 2022-2023 (Kathlyne Gish)

Chair Gish shared the draft list on the screen and stressed the importance to make the list public information so that constituents know what the MCD is doing and how to contact the members regarding the items relevant to their concern, then she asked for any additions, revisions or corrections.

Member Bleck pointed out a typographical error under the Core Advisory Group, that Member Fresquez agreed to and was changed on the spot.

Member Fresquez also informed the committee that a meeting cadence had been established with Brian Williams, the City's Emergency Manager, along with himself and a number of community members and people who work with the State, and will continue to meet every third Tuesday of the month. This will occur right before the MCD meeting and will be able to provide a timely update to the MCD. The first meeting will occur next month in May.

Member Bleck mentioned that all the PTSD references to actions/research should be eliminated since Member Hughes resigned from the committee. Chair Gish stated that the main body of the PTSD awareness information will still be included, because it is important, but she and the current members do not have enough time to do the research at this time.

Member Bleck didn't understand the item regarding hearing loss and the Public Right of Way (PROW). Chair Gish asked Member Parfitt to explain and Member Parfitt stated that while Hearing loss accessibility and loops in particular are important to new construction and retrofitting public meeting spaces for the transition plan, it was not intended to be included for the PROW. Chair Gish removed the reference.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Member Bleck suggested a modification to the second paragraph of the cover letter that Chair Gish agreed to and will modify appropriately.

Member Bleck then identified, under the transportation subcommittee, that two bullet points could be combined into one and Chair Gish made that change in real time.

Member Bleck brought up an idea concerning the Santa fe Ride vouchers that were distributed (pre-pandemic) for people with disabilities could also be funded by pandemic money and distributed by different agencies for youth and low income people.

Vice Chair Garcia mentioned that many times the vouchers are distributed by different organizations, especially for youth and low income people, but the organizations don't have funding for these type of services and tend to ask the City of Santa Fe to donate them for this purpose. This can be a difficult process, but if something was in place related to income and rules, then it would be better than depending on the City to periodically donate items such as the vouchers for use.

Member Bleck then identified another typographical error that Chair Gish corrected.

Member Parfitt mentioned that under the Health and Safety category, the bullet about the noise ordinance should add a third bullet concerning the dBA level at concerts/enforcement at public venues. Chair Gish made the addition.

Member Fresquez asked a question about the purpose of this list concerning whether it is for the City to complete, or more for the Committee to help facilitate with the City efforts to complete these priorities? Chair Gish explained that this is the MCD's way of identifying things the MCD is concerned with, interested in and needed. It gives them an idea to plan for.

Member Fresquez asked if there was anything on this list for small businesses education and training? He offered to Chair such a subcommittee. He mentioned the news story recently and the law firms that go around filing suits on small businesses and really doing a disservice to the disability and small business community alike. Education and training would be very beneficial to small businesses in the Santa Fe community.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Being a small business owner, Member Parfitt is very interested in the MCD providing this type of service. These lawsuits are horrible for small businesses, but education could save them these very costly expenses.

Vice Chair Garcia also supported the formation of a subcommittee to provide awareness to small businesses.

After the MCD unanimously voted for the new subcommittee, Member Fresquez agreed to send the description to Chair Gish to add to the priorities list.

Mayor Webber stated that he was eager to receive the MCD list of priorities to see how the City can support the MCD.

MOTION: Voting Member Garcia moved, seconded by Voting Member Bleck, to approve the Formation of a Small Business Education Outreach Subcommittee with Member Fresquez as Chair as presented.

VOTE: The motion was approved on the following Roll Call vote:

For: Voting Member Bleck, Voting Member Garcia, Voting Member Gish, Voting Member Parfitt, Voting Member Montoya-Chavez, Voting Member Jawhar, Voting Member Fresquez

Against: None

Abstain: None

- d. Approval of Letter to Mayor, et al. regarding updates to priorities by category (Kathlyne Gish)

Chair Gish agreed to modify the letter with the appropriate verbiage Member Bleck suggested to replace the second paragraph with and then requested a vote as amended.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

MOTION: Voting Member Parfitt moved, seconded by Voting Member Bleck, to approve the Priorities Letter to the Mayor as amended.

VOTE: The motion was approved on the following Roll Call vote:

For: Voting Member Bleck, Voting Member Garcia, Voting Member Gish, Voting Member Parfitt, Voting Member Montoya-Chavez, Voting Member Jawhar, Voting Member Fresquez

Against: None

Abstain: None

- e. Mayor's Committee on Disability (MCD) updates and actions discussion (Kathlyne Gish)

Chair Gish voiced her support in full for the members of the committee to progress at their own pace as required by the crazy circumstances the world is experiencing currently and for the past two years. She understands the stress brought on by these circumstances and doesn't want to add to that stress by the actions of this committee. Compassion and humanity needs to be the predominant response to everyone. She used this item as a check in with each other and wants the MCD to be supportive and not a problem. Chair Gish is grateful for their attendance and involvement. The MCD is moving forward and it doesn't matter about the pace.

Vice Chair Garcia appreciated the comments from Chair Gish and agrees with the sentiment.

Member Fresquez wrote in chat about the great job Chair Gish is doing.

Member Jawhar thanked Chair Gish for the sentiment and her availability to the individual committee members and is happy to be there for Chair Gish as well if needed. Together we make a whole, for sure.

Chair Gish expressed that the current MCD is an incredible committee and includes some of the best personnel she has been a part of since her participation with the committee back to 2013. She extended her gratitude for the efforts of the



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

committee members and appreciates them all. She commented about the wonderful job they are all doing and the achievements they are making.

8. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Update on Noise Ordinance issues that require enforcement of current requirements (Pam Parfitt)

Member Parfitt said that she is holding off on the Letter, because of the continuous shifting of guidelines and positions of those advocates pushing for change to the enforcement ordinance.

Member Parfitt has met with Director Ochoa and Chief Joye to discuss her concerns and a follow up meeting has been scheduled in May.

Member Parfitt also advised the MCD of Councilor Lindell's efforts of working toward revisions to the Noise Ordinance.

The World Health Organization (WHO) has released new updated guidelines that require changes be made to Member Parfitt's original requests regarding levels and damage to hearing. These guidelines will require further revisions to her requests for enforcement language.

Member Parfitt discussed her concerns and provided background information for the Mayor's benefit in bringing her update to his attention. She reiterated that the letter was a work in progress based on the efforts of many, for the protection of many.

Member Bleck agreed that the inclusion of language in city contracts with vendors/bands would be important.

Member Parfitt believes that education is paramount to people's health.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

Chair Gish believes that a letter of support from the MCD would benefit the efforts toward this cause and offered her assistance to Member Parfitt to issue a general letter of support by the MCD.

B. MCD Subcommittee Reports

None

9. **MATTERS FROM STAFF**

- a. A link to the video recording of this meeting will be added to the Meeting Minutes for this meeting

https://santafenm.gov.zoom.us/rec/share/DTegklipg-CkPgRvbsZgvd6BtHQPphtFz957sPkXIVaVnWgYa4KHOR3Uaqb1pAI6.xVdKjr_jckJMXAz9?startTime=1650556919000

Passcode: W?Zgw2V\$

Mr. Graham identified that the efforts are underway to advertise the MCD position available as a result of Member Hughes' resignation.

Mayor Webber was glad that he could drop in and mentioned that it is in his benefit to listen in and looks forward to the future communications from the MCD. He liked the tone and temper of the Chair's message of compassion and understanding and how relevant it was to the current circumstances going on in the world. People are very stressed out by two years of Covid. He said that having a group of people looking out for each other and working for the inclusivity of the entire community is very important and refreshing.

Mayor Webber thanked all the members for their good service and hard work. He told them to stay healthy and continue to send letters, Emails, suggestions and advice. He then emphasized the importance of the the time that Covid has brought on us all. People see the world with very fresh eyes and recognition that, one way or another, everybody's dealing with some kind of a disability, legally recognized or not and the work of the MCD is very important and beneficial to the entire community.



MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING OF
THE MAYOR'S COMMITTEE
ON DISABILITY
APRIL 21, 2022
10:00 AM
VIRTUAL MEETING

10. **MATTERS FROM THE COMMITTEE**

- a. Updates to ADA Website requirements for Title II

Chair Gish brought attention to the announcement included in the packet for the meeting regarding the Department of Justice's newly released website accessibility guidelines that would provide support of the MCD's efforts to have the City's webpage made accessible for all constituents, regardless of their disability.

11. **NEXT MEETING: May 19 2022**

12. **ADJOURN**

This venue is equipped with closed captions. Persons with disabilities in need of accommodations, contact the City Clerk's office at 955-6521, five (5) working days prior to meeting date.

Adjourned at 12:10 PM

Liaison

Chair