

**City of Santa Fe
Historic Districts Review Board
Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law**

Case # 2025-10295-HDRB

Address – 234 Irvine St.

Agent’s Name – Samantha Greenberg

Owner/Applicant’s Name – Eden Kark

THIS MATTER came before the Historic Districts Review Board (“Board”) for hearing on May 27, 2025.

BACKGROUND

The single-family residence and accessory structure at 234 Irvine St. is listed on the City’s map of historic properties as contributing to the Westside Guadalupe Historic District. The 1,796-square-foot main residence was constructed prior to 1928 of adobe with a hip roof. According to the 2025 Historic Cultural Properties Inventory, the property is part of the 1887 Irvine Addition, which was the first subdivision on the west side of Santa Fe. The house features deep-inset wood windows, many of which contain lead lozenge décor in the upper sashes. Several of the windows appear to have been repaired with non-historic components, and four are clad, aluminum and metal. The rear or west facade features a recent porch addition. Sometime after 1978, the original rear porch was enclosed and extended west off the back of the house. Other modifications to the main residence include a mechanical room addition on the north, as well as a recent porch mudroom addition, all after 1978.

The accessory structure was constructed of concrete masonry units (CMU) sometime after 1935 and was converted to dwelling units in 1980. In 2019, the carport was enclosed and extended, which was done without the requisite permits and resulted in a red tag violation. The building features modern glass doors, newer windows in the carport section, and a low pitch gable on the west side. The carport addition is the subject of Case # H-10-006 which was approved for a 572-square-foot carport with a height of 11 feet on the non-contributing shed structure. Since 2010, there have been no cases for the property, with the exception of the 2019 case initiated due to a red-tag violation.

The property has an eastern street frontage yard wall that was constructed of concrete block sometime prior 1985. While the exact date is unknown, the yard wall was raised to a varying height of 68” to 90”. The yard wall features a rounded gate arch and window openings. The yard wall is non-contributing due to age. Additionally on the west property line, there is a latilla fence on low rock foundation, which was constructed after 1978. No primary facades for either the main residence or the accessory structure have been designated. The yard wall has not been assigned a historic status.

APPLICANT’S REQUEST:

The Applicant requests the following:

1. A status review with primary façade designation, if applicable, for a residential structure.
2. A downgrade from contributing to non-contributing status for an accessory dwelling structure.
3. A status review for a street-frontage yard wall.

Staff recommends the main residence be maintained as contributing. While the structure has been modified and altered over the years, several of its distinctive historic properties are preserved, particularly on the north, east and south facades. The core of the residence remains distinctive, particularly the inset windows and the pitched hip roof on the adobe structure. Staff recommends the primary façades as the north, east and south façades (5, 6, and 7 on the façade diagram) which hold the original footprint of the residence, with the exceptions of the non-historic doors and windows and the non-historic east-elevation porch.

The record of the accessory structure is inconsistent regarding its historic status. Staff recommends designating its status as non-contributing. Although the accessory structure was 50 years old at the time of the 2010 case, it was listed as non-contributing then. Currently, it is listed as contributing on the City's map, but there has been no additional status review since 2010, and Staff cannot identify why it is listed on the map as contributing. Staff recommends the yard wall be designated as non-contributing due to its modernity.

FINDINGS OF FACT

After conducting a public hearing and having heard from the Applicant and all interested persons, the Board hereby FINDS, as follows:

1. Historic Preservation Staff reviewed the application and related materials and information submitted by the Applicant for conformity with applicable Santa Fe City Code ("SFCC") requirements and provided the Board with a written report of its findings ("Staff Report"), which evaluates the factors relevant to the application.
2. Historic Preservation Staff Recommendation: Per SFCC Section 14-5.2(C)(2), Designation of Significant, Contributing or Non-Contributing Status Within Historic Districts: Staff recommended the historic status of the residential structure be retained as contributing with the primary façades designated as the north, east and south facades. Staff recommended excluding the non-historic doors and windows and the non-historic east elevation porch from the designation. Staff recommended that the accessory structure be designated as non-contributing. Staff also recommended that the yard wall be designated as non-contributing.
3. The project is subject to SFCC Section 14-5.2(C), Regulation of Significant and Contributing Structures.
4. The project is subject to the requirements and general design standards set forth in SFCC Section 14-5.2(D), General Design Standards.
5. The property is located in the West-Guadalupe Historic District and is subject to the district design standards set forth in SFCC Section 14-5.2(I).

6. SFCC Section 14-5.2(C)(2)(a-c) gives the Board authority to review and approve “significant,” “contributing,” or “non-contributing” status designations and to designate primary façades of contributing structures.
7. Under SFCC Section 14-12.1, the definition of a “contributing structure” is “a structure, located in a Historic District, approximately 50 years old or older that helps to establish and maintain the character of that Historic District. Although a contributing structure is not unique in itself, it adds to the historic associations or historic architectural design qualities that are significant for a district. The contributing structure may have had minor alterations, but its integrity remains.”
8. Under SFCC Section 14-12.1, the definition of a “primary façade” is one or more principal faces or elevations of a building with features that define the character of the building’s architecture.
9. Under SFCC Section 14-12.1, the definition of a “non-contributing structure” is a “structure, located in a Historic District, that is less than 50 years old or that does not exhibit sufficient historic integrity to establish and maintain the character of the Historic District.”
10. Based on the information set forth in the Staff Report and exhibits and the testimony and evidence presented at the hearing, the Board finds that the main residential structure meets the definition of a “contributing structure,” as recommended by Staff.
11. The Board finds that the primary elevations of the main residential structure with the features that define the character of the structure’s architecture are the east façade (façade 6), original easternmost north façade (façade 5), and original easternmost south façade (façade 7), excluding the non-historic doors and windows and excluding the non-historic east elevation porch. These facades hold the original footprint and historic details of the residence, including the inset wood windows with lead lozenge patterns and the original roof line of the building.
12. Based on the information set forth in the Staff Report and exhibits and the testimony and evidence presented at the hearing, the Board finds that the accessory residential structure meets the definition of a “non-contributing structure,” as recommended by Staff.
13. Based on the information set forth in the Staff Report and exhibits and the testimony and evidence presented at the hearing, the Board finds that the yard wall meets the definition of a “non-contributing structure,” as recommended by Staff.
14. The information contained in the application and provided in testimony and evidence establishes that all applicable requirements for Board review have been met.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Under the circumstances and given the evidence and testimony submitted during the hearing, the Board acted upon the application as follows:

1. The Board has the authority to review and approve the application.
2. The Board grants the Applicant’s request to review historic status.
3. The Board designates the main residential structure as a contributing structure.
4. The Board designates the following elevations of the main residential structure as the primary façades: north, east, and south facades (facades 5, 6, and 7 respectively),

excluding the non-historic doors and windows and excluding the non-historic east-elevation porch.

5. The Board designates the accessory dwelling unit as a non-contributing structure.
6. The Board designates the yard wall as a non-contributing structure.

IT IS SO ORDERED ON THIS 13th DAY of JANUARY, 2026, BY THE HISTORIC DISTRICTS REVIEW BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA FE.

Cecilia Rios
Chair

Date

FILED:

City Clerk

Date

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

Frank Ruybalid
Assistant City Attorney

Date