

City of Santa Fe, New Mexico

memo

DATE: August, 12, 2025

TO: Historic Districts Review Board

VIA: Heather Lamboy, Planning & Land Use Department Director 
Maggie Moore, Assistant Land Use Director
Gary Moquino, Historic Preservation Division Manager *GM*

FROM: Paul A. Duran, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Division

2025-010869-HDRB, 516 and 516 ½ Alto St., Westside Guadalupe Historic District, Contributing, Marc Naktin, agent for Steve Dayton, owner, requests status review with primary façade designation(s) if applicable.

REFERENCE ATTACHMENTS (Sequentially):

CITY SUBMITTALS

District Standards & yard wall & fence standards.

Historic Inventory Form

Zoning Review Sheet

Other: Proposed Façade Diagram and Previous Case Documents

APPLICANT SUBMITTALS

Proposal Letter

Site Plan/Floor Plan

Elevations

Photographs

Other:

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the historic status of the main residential structure be maintained as contributing and the north elevation be designated as primary identified in the Proposed Façade Diagram as numbers one and two and the stand-alone garage retain its contributing status with the east elevation designated as primary identified in the Proposed Façade Diagram as number 1, per 14-5.2(C) Designation of Significant, Contributing or Noncontributing Status Within Historic Districts.

Sample motions:

- a. Approve or deny Case #2025-010869 to maintain contributing status at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street.
- b. Approve or deny Case #2025-010869 to upgrade the status to significant status at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street.
- c. Approve or deny Case #2025-010869 to downgrade the status to non-contributing status at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street.

BACKGROUND & SUMMARY:

The single-family residence at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street are listed as contributing to the Westside-Guadalupe Historic District with the north elevations designated as the primary facades. The Santa Fe County Tax Parcel information identifies that the structure was built in AD 1710 on a 0.25-acre parcel with 2,932 sq. ft. of roofed area. It is noted that a 280 sq. ft. flat-roofed carport was constructed in 1935, and a 320 sq. ft. detached garage was built in 1953. The structure speaks to a combination of Spanish Pueblo, Territorial, and New Mexico Vernacular design styles as seen by the one-story adobe structures constructed with hipped corrugated metal roofs, mud plaster walls, and rectangular floor plans with a simple porch along the streetscape (Architectural Classification: Style and Type 2013:2-10).

In Mr. John Murphey's 2025 Historic Cultural Property Inventory (HCPI) survey form addresses the 1996 Historic District Review Board (HDRB) changes to what is known today as 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street. The changes included wholesale replacement of doors and windows, a glazed corridor connecting the two structures, new front porch, and replacement of the roof (Murphey 2025:3). Mr. Murphey discusses prior to the renovation and connecting the structures the independent structures comprised of small residential adobe structures with hipped and flat roofs (Murphey 2025:5). In Mr. Murphey's final evaluation recommended the main structure maintain a contributing status with the north elevation designated as primary and the stand-alone garage retain its contributing status with the east elevation designated as primary. Staff is in agreement with the historical assessment and evaluation.

Previous cases at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street include:

On March 22, 1994, in Case No. H-94-42, the Historic Design Review Board (Board) reviewed the proposed roof replacement, wholesale window replacement, enclosure of the north porch, south elevation addition, and covered walkway connecting to the neighboring west building at 516 Alto Street. The case was tabled at the hearing.

On March 22, 1994, in Case No. H-94-43, the Board reviewed the proposed roof replacement, rebuild east elevation portal, remove east elevation (modern) addition, wholesale window replacement, and covered walkway connecting to neighboring east building at 516 ½ Alto Street. The case was tabled at the hearing.

On May 9, 1995, in Case No. H-95-63, the Board tabled the proposed renovations and additions to structures at 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street.

APPLICANT'S REQUEST:

The applicant requests status review with primary façade designation(s) if applicable.



Figure 1: Proposed Façade Diagram for 516 and 516 ½ Alto Street.

Primary Façade: ———

Non-primary Façade: ———

RELEVANT CODE CITATIONS:

14-5.2 HISTORIC DISTRICTS

(A) General Provisions

(1) General Purpose

In order to promote the economic, cultural, and general welfare of the people of the *city* and to ensure the harmonious, orderly and efficient growth and *development* of the *city*, it is deemed essential by the *governing body* that the qualities relating to the history of Santa Fe, and a harmonious outward appearance, which preserve *property* values and attract tourists and residents alike, be preserved, some of these qualities being:

- (a) The continued existence and *preservation* of historical areas and *buildings*;
- (b) The continued construction of *buildings* in the historic styles; and
- (c) A general harmony as to style, form, color, height, proportion, texture and material between *buildings* of historic design and those of more modern design.

(C) Regulation of Significant and Contributing Structures in the Historic Districts

(Ord. No. 2004-26)

(1) Purpose and Intent

It is intended that:

- (a) Each *structure* to be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical *development*, such as the addition of conjectural features or architectural elements from other *buildings*, shall not be undertaken;
- (b) Changes to *structures* that have acquired historic *significance* in their own right shall be retained and preserved, recognizing that most *structures* change over time;
- (c) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a *structure* be preserved; and
- (d) New additions and related or adjacent new construction be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the original form and integrity of the historic *property* and its environment would be unimpaired.

(2) Designation of Significant, Contributing, or Noncontributing Status within Historic Districts

(a) Status Designation

Structures within historic districts may be designated a status of "significant," "contributing," or "noncontributing" based upon the definitions of these terms in Article 14-12. Staff shall maintain a record as to the current status of *structures* located in the Historic Districts.

(b) Board Authority to Review Status Designation

- (i) The Board is authorized to change the status of a *structure* or to designate a status for a *structure* with no status designated.
- (ii) A change in status or the designation of a status shall be based upon an evaluation of data provided through survey or other relevant sources of information and the definitions of "significant," "contributing," or "noncontributing."

(e) Appeals (Ord. No. 2009-42 § 16)

Decisions made by the historic districts review board may be appealed to the *governing body* as set forth in Section 14-3.17.

(f) Restoration of Status

If a *property owner* makes changes to a *structure* without the proper *city* approvals which result in the lowering of the *structure's* status, staff or the board may require the *property owner* to restore the *structure* such that its former status is restored.

DEFINITIONS:

14-12 Significant Structure:

A structure located in a historic district that is approximately fifty years old or older, and that embodies distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction. For a structure to be designated as significant, it must retain a high level of historic integrity. A structure may be designated as significant:

- (A) for its association with events or persons that are important on a local, regional, national or global level; or
- (B) if it is listed on or is eligible to be listed on the State Register of Cultural Properties or the National Register of Historic Places.

14-12 Contributing Structure:

A structure, located in a historic district, approximately fifty years old or older that helps to establish and maintain the character of that historic district. Although a contributing structure is not unique in itself, it adds to the historic associations or historic architectural design qualities that are significant for a district. The contributing structure may have had minor alterations, but its integrity remains.

14-12 Noncontributing Structure:

A structure, located in an H district, that is less than fifty years old or that does not exhibit sufficient historic integrity to establish and maintain the character of the H District.

14-12 Primary Façade:

One or more principal faces or elevations of a building with features that define the character of the building's architecture.