

City of Santa Fe, New Mexico

memo

DATE: February 25, 2025
TO: Historic Districts Review Board
VIA: Heather Lamboy, Planning and Land Use Department Director *HLL*
Maggie Moore, Assistant Director *MM*
Gary Moquino, Historic Preservation Division Manager *GM*
FROM: Paul A. Duran, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Division

2025-009916-HDRB, 1010 Camino San Acacio, Downtown and Eastside Historic District, Contributing. Daniel Strongwater, agent for Jeremy and Caroline Rohrich, owner, proposes to construct a 278 sq. ft. casita and covered portal above an existing carport, construct a 175 sq. ft. closet addition on the east elevation, enclose a portal on the south elevation and requests exceptions to 14-5.2(D)(4) to enclose an existing portal and 14-5.2(D)(2)(c) for an addition to the west primary façade.

REFERENCE ATTACHMENTS (Sequentially):

CITY SUBMITTALS

District Standards & yard wall
& fence standards.

Historic Inventory Form

Zoning Review Sheet

Other: Primary Façade Diagram

APPLICANT SUBMITTALS

Proposal Letter

Site Plan/Floor Plan

Elevations

Photographs

Other:

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends conditional approval of the proposed project requesting the skylight on the east façade be non-publicly visible and that all windows meet the 30” rule except those under porches or portals, and finds that the exception criterion has been met, and complies with Section 14-5.2(D) General Design Standards for all Historic Districts, and 14-5.2(E) Downtown and Eastside Historic District Design Standards.

BACKGROUND & SUMMARY:

The single-family residence at 1010 Camino San Acacio is listed as contributing to the Downtown and Eastside Historic District with the north and west elevations designated as primary. The 2,874 sq. ft. main residential structure was built on a 0.27-acre lot in the early 1960s. The main structure was built in the Spanish Pueblo Revival architectural style as seen by the adobe and rock foundation construction materials, recessed door and windows, and wooden corbel elements. The structure was built by Mr. Louie Ewing, a well-known artist who lived and worked in Santa Fe from 1935-1983. Mr. Ewing was most well-known for his photographic work for the Laboratory of Anthropology in 1939.

Previous Historic Districts Review Board (HDRB) cases include:

On January 14, 2025, in Case No. 2024-009653-HDRB, the Board adopted staff's recommendation that the house be designated as contributing. The contributing designation was based on the staff report, presentation and the information in the HCPI form. In their decision, the Board moved that the rock wall along the street be designated as contributing and that facades 1 and 9 be designated as primary. Additionally, the Board found that while facade number 2 was not primary, the facade does have distinctive characteristics that are important to be retained, specifically the roof line and the continuation of the corbel patterns on the other facades. The ordinance allows the Board to preserve such characteristic historic features even on non-primary facades. Whereas, on the primary facades (1 and 9), the non-historic windows were excluded from the designation, with the exception of the stained-glass window which is included in the primary facade designation and also specifically recognized as important to the character of the house. Finally, the Board identified the rubble rock foundation as a characteristic worthy of preservation and the openings of the windows are all historic and should be preserved as such.

The current request (Case 2025-009916-HDRB) is for a remodel which includes the following:

- 1) Construct a 278 sq. ft. casita and covered portal above the existing carport.
- 2) Construct a 175 sq. ft. closet addition on the east façade.
- 3) Carport excavation to a ceiling height of 8 ft.
- 4) Parking space remodel with dry-stack retaining wall on the northeast corner of the property.
- 5) Enclose existing upper landing of entry stairway on the west primary façade which adds 98 sq. ft. of conditioned space which requires an exception to 14-5.2(D)(2)(c) addition are not permitted on a primary façade.
- 6) Enclose existing south portal for additional 287 sq. ft. which requires an exception to 14-5.2(D)(4) existing porches and portals shall not be enclosed.



1010 Camino San Acacio: Primary Façade Diagram

Primary Façade: ————

Non-primary Façade: ————

EXCEPTION CRITERIA AND RESPONSES:

Exception to 14-5.2(D)(2)(c) additions are not permitted to primary facades: The applicant requests an exception to construct an addition to the west primary façade.

(i) *Do not damage the character of the district*

Applicant Response: The enclosure of the Entry and South Portal harmonize with the district and home through re-use of existing architectural detailing, color and material palettes. The South Portal is non-publicly visible, thus not contributing to the public character of the district. The Entry, while visible, is a substantially de-emphasized component of the project, tucked far back from the street up a staircase. The proposed design maintains the important surrounding components of visible corbels, roofline and facade elements while increasing the utility and legibility of the entry by enclosing interior space, providing an improvement that not damaging the character of the district.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The addition to the west primary façade will not adversely affect the contributing status of the structure or the western primary façade. The design accentuates what is currently established.

(ii) *Are required to prevent a hardship to the applicant or an injury to the public welfare*

Applicant Response: The Rohrlich family returned to Santa Fe to raise their own children, and care for aging family. They have outgrown the living space and hope to add square footage and year-round utility to the home while maintaining its architectural character. To prevent the financial, emotional and physical hardship associated with leaving this home, the proposed design enables the family to stay in place. The new entry and foyer provide a more practical entry to the house in all seasons, with additional security provided through the closure of an existing opening in the yard wall and more substantial door/entry. The proposed casita is intended for aging family members to be cared for by the family at home. An enclosed connection to the casita is required for this to allow in-home care. Lastly, the homeowners seek to avoid hardship to the community and project site associated with further disturbance to the constrained and inclined project site. Enclosing the portal and entry avoid new excavation while still adding square footage and improve resident access without additional roofed area or new foundation.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The addition to the west primary façade will not adversely affect the contributing status of the structure or the western primary façade, while providing the family the necessary roofed area for their family.

(iii) *Strengthen the unique heterogeneous character of the City by providing a full range of design options to ensure that residents can continue to reside within the historic districts*

Applicant Response: This proposal balances the family's' desire to reside in the historic district in a house that both maintains its historic character, while also serving their practical needs as a multigenerational family. Through their stewardship, the Rohrlich's will continue to care for the home, strengthening its unique contribution to the character of the neighborhood.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The addition to the west primary façade will not adversely affect the

contributing status of the structure or the western primary façade. The design accentuates what is currently established.

Exception to 14-5.2(D)(4) existing porches and portals shall not be enclosed: The applicant requests an exception to enclose the south portal.

(i) *Do not damage the character of the district*

Applicant Response: The enclosure of the Entry and South Portal harmonize with the district and home through re-use of existing architectural detailing, color and material palettes. The South Portal is non-publicly visible, thus not contributing to the public character of the district. The Entry, while visible, is a substantially de-emphasized component of the project, tucked far back from the street up a staircase. The proposed design maintains the important surrounding components of visible corbels, roofline and facade elements while increasing the utility and legibility of the entry by enclosing interior space, providing an improvement that not damaging the character of the district.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The enclosure of the south portal will not adversely affect the contributing status of the structure. The design accentuates what is currently established.

(ii) *Are required to prevent a hardship to the applicant or an injury to the public welfare*

Applicant Response: The Rohrlich family returned to Santa Fe to raise their own children, and care for aging family. They have outgrown the living space and hope to add square footage and year-round utility to the home while maintaining its architectural character. To prevent the financial, emotional and physical hardship associated with leaving this home, the proposed design enables the family to stay in place. The new entry and foyer provide a more practical entry to the house in all seasons, with additional security provided through the closure of an existing opening in the yard wall and more substantial door/entry. The proposed casita is intended for aging family members to be cared for by the family at home. An enclosed connection to the casita is required for this to allow in-home care. Lastly, the homeowners seek to avoid hardship to the community and project site associated with further disturbance to the constrained and inclined project site. Enclosing the portal and entry avoid new excavation while still adding square footage and improve resident access without additional roofed area or new foundation.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The enclosure of the south portal will not adversely affect the contributing status of the structure, while providing the family the necessary roofed area for their family.

(iii) *Strengthen the unique heterogeneous character of the City by providing a full range of design options to ensure that residents can continue to reside within the historic districts*

Applicant Response: This proposal balances the family's' desire to reside in the historic district in a house that both maintains its historic character, while also serving their practical needs as a multigenerational family. Through their stewardship, the Rohrlich's will continue to care for the home, strengthening its unique contribution to the character of the neighborhood.

Staff Response: Staff has evaluated the applicant's response and finds that the exception criterion has been met. The enclosure of the south portal will not adversely affect the contributing status of the structure. The design accentuates what is currently established.

RELEVANT CODE CITATIONS:

14-5.2 HISTORIC DISTRICTS

(A) General Provisions

(1) General Purpose

In order to promote the economic, cultural, and general welfare of the people of the *city* and to ensure the harmonious, orderly and efficient growth and *development* of the *city*, it is deemed essential by the *governing body* that the qualities relating to the history of Santa Fe, and a harmonious outward appearance, which preserve *property* values and attract tourists and residents alike, be preserved, some of these qualities being:

- (a) The continued existence and *preservation* of historical areas and *buildings*;
- (b) The continued construction of *buildings* in the historic styles; and
- (c) A general harmony as to style, form, color, height, proportion, texture and material between *buildings* of historic design and those of more modern design.

(4) Compliance with General and Specific Design Standards Required

All *development* located within the historic districts and subject to this Section 14-5.2 shall comply with all applicable general *development* standards set forth in Subsection 14-5.2(D), as well as any applicable specific *development* standards set forth in Subsections 14-5.2(E) through (I).

(5) Exceptions

Staff shall determine whether an exception to this section is required. The historic board may grant an exception to the regulations set forth in this section provided that such exception does not exceed the underlying zoning.

(a) Height

If the *applicant* requests approval of a height in the historic district that exceeds the underlying zoning district requirement, the *applicant* shall first receive an exception to this Section 14-5.2. If approved by the historic board, the *applicant* shall proceed to the board of adjustment or other applicable *city* body for consideration of the proposed variance.

(b) Design Standards and Signage

The board may recommend exceptions to Subsections 14-5.2(D)(1-8, 10-11) and 14-5.2(E) through (I) for construction or alterations within the historic district. The recommendation for exceptions shall be made to the *governing body*. Procedures for public notice and hearing before the *governing body* shall be as set forth in Section 14-3.6(B)(3). Exceptions are *project* specific and do not apply to the subject *property* in perpetuity. If approved by the *governing body*, the inspections and enforcement *office* shall accept and review an *application* for, and issue, as appropriate, a *building permit*. The *applicant* for such exceptions shall conclusively demonstrate and the board shall make a positive finding of fact that such exceptions comply with all the criteria listed as follows:

- (i) Do not damage the character of the district;
- (ii) Are required to prevent a hardship to the *applicant* or an injury to the public welfare; and
- (iii) Strengthen the unique heterogeneous character of the *City* by providing a full range of design options to ensure that residents can continue to reside within the historic districts.

(D) General Design Standards for All H Districts

In any review of proposed additions or alterations to *structures* that have been declared significant or contributing in any historic district or a *landmark* in any part of the *city*, the following standards shall be met:

(1) General

- (a) The status of a significant, contributing, or *landmark structure* shall be retained and preserved. If a proposed alteration will cause a *structure* to lose its significant, contributing, or *landmark* status, the *application* shall be denied. The removal of historic materials or alteration of architectural features and spaces that embody the status shall be prohibited.
- (b) If a proposed alteration or new construction will cause an adjacent *structure* to lose its significant, contributing, or *landmark* status, the *application* may be denied.

(2) Additions

- (a) Additions shall have similar materials, architectural *treatments* and styles, features, and details as the existing *structure*, but shall not duplicate those of the existing *structure* in a manner that will make the addition indistinguishable from the existing *structure*.
- (b) Additions to *buildings* that meet the standards of Subsection 14-5.2(E) shall continue to meet those standards set forth in Subsection 14-5.2(E) in addition to the standards set forth in this section.
- (c) Additions are not permitted to *primary façades*.
- (d) Additions are not permitted to the side of the existing footprint unless the addition is set back a minimum of ten (10) feet from the primary facade. The addition shall not exceed fifty percent of the square footage of the existing footprint, and shall not exceed fifty percent of the existing dimension of the primary facade. To the extent

architecturally practicable, new additions shall be attached to any existing noncontributing portion of *structures* instead of attaching them to the significant or contributing portion.

(e) The height of additions:

- (i) For significant and *landmark structures* shall be a minimum of six (6) inches less than the parapet or equivalent roof-feature of the existing adjacent connecting facade.
- (ii) For contributing *structures* shall be no more than one additional *story* higher than the existing *structure*. To the extent architecturally practicable, two-story additions shall be set to the rear or the side rear of the *structure*. When an additional *story* is to be placed upon an existing contributing *structure*, that footprint may be no greater than fifty percent of the footprint of the existing *structure*, subject to the provisions of Subsection A(1) above. For the purposes of this paragraph, an additional *story* shall not exceed twelve (12) feet from the existing rooftop to the highest point of that *story*.

(3) Remodeling to Increase Height; Rooftop Appurtenances

- (a) For *remodeling* of existing significant and *landmark structures*, no increase in height of the *structures* is permitted. (For standards relating to additions to existing *structures*, see paragraph (2) above.)
- (b) For significant and *landmark structures*, *publicly visible* roof top appurtenances, including but not limited to solar collectors, clerestories, decks, or mechanical equipment, shall not be added nor shall the parapet be raised to conceal the *rooftop appurtenances*. For contributing *buildings* solar collectors, clerestories, decks, or mechanical equipment if *publicly visible* shall not be added.

(4) Porches and Portals

Existing *porches* or *portals* shall not be enclosed.

(5) Windows, Doors, and Other Architectural Features

- (a) For all facades of significant and *landmark structures* and for the primary facades of contributing *structures*:
 - (i) Historic windows shall be repaired or restored wherever possible. Historic windows that cannot be repaired or restored shall be duplicated in the size, style, and material of the original. Thermal double pane glass may be used. No opening shall be widened or narrowed.
 - (ii) No new opening shall be made where one presently does not exist unless historic documentation supports its prior existence.
 - (iii) No existing opening shall be closed.
- (b) For all façades of significant, contributing and *landmark structures*, architectural features, finishes, and details other than doors and windows, shall be repaired rather than replaced. In the event *replacement* is necessary, the use of new material may be approved. The new material shall match the material being replaced in

composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. *Replacement* or duplication of missing features shall be substantiated by documentation, physical or pictorial evidence.

(6) Roofs

The existing roof styles and materials shall be maintained or replaced in kind if necessary. The addition of dormers or other roof features should only be considered when they are an existing or historical feature of the *structure*.

(8) Archaeological Resources

Discovery of archaeological resources made during the historic districts review process shall be referred to the archaeological review committee.

(9) Height, Pitch, Scale, Massing and Floor Stepbacks

The height, pitch, *scale*, and massing of any *structure* in an historic district, as defined in this section, shall be limited as provided for in this section, unless further restricted within this chapter.

(a) Applicability

The following sections identify specific areas and specific *projects* subject to this section. Planning and land use department staff shall determine whether or not properties are included within this section. (Ord. No. 2007-45 § 30; Ord. #2020-22, § 16)

- F. When the proposed *building*, *yardwall*, or fence is located in a *streetscape* that includes no *buildings*, *yardwalls*, or fences, the height of the proposed *building* shall not exceed sixteen (16) feet. *Yardwalls* and fences in this *streetscape* shall not exceed five (5) feet in height.

(c) Height

(ii) In exercising its authority under this section, the board shall limit the height of *structures* as set forth in this section. Heights of existing *structures* shall be as set forth on the official map of *building* heights in the historic districts.

- A. If a proposed *building* has a parapet, the façade shall not be in excess of two (2) feet of the average of the height of the façades in the *streetscape*.
- B. If the proposed *building* has a pitched roof, the ridge height of the proposed *building* shall not be in excess of two (2) feet of the average of the ridge height of the pitched roofs in the *streetscape*.
- C. *Yardwalls* and fences shall be limited to a height that does not exceed the average of the height of other *yardwalls* and fences in the *streetscape*.
- D. Pursuant to Section 14-7.4(C), the height of any other *structure* shall be limited to the allowable *building* height within the applicable *streetscape*, as defined in this section. (Ord. No. 2002-37 § 26)

- E. The height and dimension of signage are as set forth in Section 14-8.10(H).
- F. The board may increase the allowable height for proposed *buildings* and additions located on a sloping site where the difference in the natural *grade* along the *structure's* foundation exceeds two (2) feet. In no case shall the height of a façade exceed four (4) feet above the allowable height of the applicable *streetscape* measured from natural or finished *grade*, whichever is more restrictive. This increase in height shall be constructed only in the form of *building* stepbacks from the *street*.

(d) Pitch

If the determined *streetscape* includes over fifty percent of *buildings* with pitched roofs, the proposed *building* may have a pitched roof. A pitched roof is defined as a gable, shed, or *hipped roof*. The pitch of the roof shall match the predominant pitch extant in the *streetscape*.

(e) Scale

The height of a proposed *building* or addition, its façade length, and its roof form and pitch shall appear to be in proportion to the height, façade length, and roof form and pitch of *buildings* in the applicable *streetscape*, or the *building* on which the addition is proposed.

(f) Massing and Floor Stepbacks

The Board may require that upper floor levels be stepped back, to carry out the intent of this section; provided that the board in making such determinations shall take into account whether the height of the proposed *building*, *yardwall*, fence, or proposed stepback of upper floor levels is in harmony with the massing of the applicable *streetscape* and *preservation* of the historic and characteristic visual qualities of the *streetscape*. The Board shall also require that the *publicly visible* façades of the *structure* be in conformance with Subsections 14-5.2(E) through (H), and in meeting those requirements, may require that different floor levels be stepped back.

(E) Downtown and Eastside Design Standards

The *governing body* recognizes that a style of architecture has evolved within the *city* from the year 1600 to the present characterized by construction with *adobe*, hereafter called "old Santa Fe style", and that another style has evolved, hereafter called "recent Santa Fe style", which is a *development* from, and an elaboration of the old Santa Fe style, with different materials and frequently with added decorations.

(1) Old Santa Fe Style

Old Santa Fe style, characterized by construction with *adobe*, is defined as including the so-called "pueblo" or "pueblo-Spanish" or "Spanish-Indian" and "territorial" styles and is more specifically described as follows:

- (a) With rare exception, *buildings* are of one *story*, few have three stories, and the characteristic effect is that the *buildings* are long and low. Roofs are flat with a slight *slope* and surrounded on at least three sides by a firewall of the same color and material as the *walls* or of brick. Roofs are never carried out beyond the line of the *walls* except to cover an enclosed *portal* or *porch* formed by setting back a portion of the *wall* or to form an exterior *portal*, the outer edge of the roof being supported by wooden columns. Two- *story* construction is more common in the territorial than in other sub-styles, and is preferably accompanied by a balcony at the level of the floor of the second *story*. Façades are flat, varied by inset *portales*, exterior *portales*, projecting vigas or roof beams, canales or water-spouts, flanking buttresses and wooden lintels, architraves and cornices, which, as well as doors, are frequently carved and the carving may be picked out with bright colors. Arches are almost never used except for nonfunctional arches, often slightly ogive, over gateways in freestanding *walls*;
 - (b) All exterior *walls* of a *building* are painted alike. The colors range from a light earth color to a dark earth color. The exception to this rule is the protected space under *portales*, or in church-derived designs, inset panels in a *wall* under the roof, in which case the roof overhangs the panel. These spaces may be painted white or a contrasting color, or have mural decorations;
 - (c) Solid *wall* space is always greater in any façade than window and door space combined. Single panes of glass larger than thirty (30) inches in any dimension are not permissible except as otherwise provided in this section;
 - (d) The rule as to flat roofs shall not be construed to prevent the construction of skylights or installation of air conditioning devices, or any other necessary roof *structures*, but such *structures* other than chimneys, flues, vents and aerials, shall be so placed as to be concealed by the firewall from the view of anyone standing in the *street* on which the *building* fronts;
 - (e) True old Santa Fe style *buildings* are made of *adobe* with mud plaster finish. Construction with masonry blocks, bricks, or other materials with which the *adobe* effect can be simulated is permissible; provided, that the exterior *walls* are not less than eight (8) inches thick and that geometrically straight façade lines are avoided. Mud plaster or hard plaster simulating *adobe*, laid on smoothly, is required; and
 - (f) It is characteristic of old Santa Fe style commercial *buildings* to place a *portal* so that it covers the entire sidewalk, the columns being set at the curb line.
- (2) Recent Santa Fe Style

Recent Santa Fe style intends to achieve harmony with historic *buildings* by *retention* of a similarity of materials, color, proportion, and general detail. The dominating effect is to be that of *adobe* construction, prescribed as follows:

- (a) No *building* shall be over two stories in height in any façade unless the façade shall include projecting or recessed *portales*, *setbacks* or other design elements;
- (b) The combined door and window area in any *publicly visible* façade shall not exceed forty percent of the total area of the façade except for doors or windows located

under a *portal*. No door or window in a *publicly visible* façade shall be located nearer than three (3) feet from the corner of the façade;

- (c) No cantilevers shall be permitted except over projecting vigas, beams, or wood corbels, or as part of the roof *treatment* described below;
- (d) No less than eighty percent of the surface area of any *publicly visible* façade shall be *adobe* finish, or stucco simulating *adobe* finish. The balance of the *publicly visible* façade, except as above, may be of natural stone, wood, brick, tile, terra cotta, or other material, subject to approval as hereinafter provided for *building permits*;
- (e) The *publicly visible* façade of any *building* and of any adjoining *walls* shall, except as otherwise provided, be of one color, which color shall simulate a light earth or dark earth color, matte or dull finish and of relatively smooth texture. Façade surfaces under *portales* may be of contrasting or complimentary colors. Windows, doors and *portals* on *publicly visible* portions of the *building* and *walls* shall be of one of the old Santa Fe styles; except that *buildings* with *portals* may have larger plate glass areas for windows under *portals* only. Deep window recesses are characteristic; and
- (f) Flat roofs shall have not more than thirty (30) inches overhang.

DEFINITIONS:

14-12 Contributing Structure:

A structure, located in a historic district, approximately fifty years old or older that helps to establish and maintain the character of that historic district. Although a contributing structure is not unique in itself, it adds to the historic associations or historic architectural design qualities that are significant for a district. The contributing structure may have had minor alterations, but its integrity remains.

14-12 Primary Façade:

One or more principal faces or elevations of a building with features that define the character of the building's architecture.